| **Student Name:** Oscar | P1 |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This House Would Place significant tax on companies that use Artificial Intelligence. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s choice of words was persuasive and strategic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |

| **Teacher comments:**  Good ideas, but needs to be fleshed out. I am unclear how exactly unemployment will be as massive as you claim it to be. I am also unclear why significant taxation is something big companies cannot take!  **Opening**   * I like that your hook talked about unemployment clearly, and that also became your debate winning focus later! * Please deliver with more conviction!   **Setup**   * Please do some trend analysis here, what is the world looking like right now? Is AI taking over already?   **Arg 1**   * I like that you focused specifically about people with lower income here, especially those who would get affected more! * I am unclear why robbing and so on is so likely to increase as an outcome of this!   **Arg 2**   * I am unclear why AI would lead to price decrease, what is the mechanism here? * Please explain the nuances of how less cost in production leads to less cost in final pricing!   **Style**   * We need a more confident body language, and we need more hand gestures! * We need to generally increase our eye contact (to all of the audience)! * Lets have better enunciations in speech! * Please try to adopt some facial structure as well! * We also need to speak longer!   03:15! |
| --- |

| **Student Name:** Luca | O1 |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This House Would Place significant tax on companies that use Artificial Intelligence. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s choice of words was persuasive and strategic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |

| **Teacher comments:**  Good ideas, but needs to be fleshed out. I am unclear how exactly welfare projects will span out!  **Opening**   * I like that your hook talked about how AI can be beneficial for companies and people! * Please deliver with more conviction! * I also think you need to make the hook more engaging, instead of that sounding like a stance only!   **Rebuttal**   * I like how you called out the extremities of their arguments clearly! * I appreciate that you engaged with them at the beginning too! * Please explicitly flag what you are responding to, to make your responses more effective!   **Arg 1**   * AI can learn by itself, and it can be much more innovative! * Good use of BARD examples here, on LLM self learning! * Good nuance on how solutions are likely quicker; also good addition on how automation means no need to take a break, and so on! * We need more analysis on why cheap AI labor is a good thing. Is it because product prices coming down helps those who otherwise would not be able to achieve them?   **Arg 2**   * Good argument that you can have a welfare plan by the government! * I also like how you nuanced how you have capacity for welfare, through VAT and corporate tax, and so on! * Please add here why most people would be working by themselves anyway!   **Style**   * We need a more confident body language, and we need more hand gestures! * We need to generally increase our eye contact (to all of the audience)! * Lets have better enunciations in speech! * Please try to adopt some facial structure as well! * We also need to speak longer!   04:40 |
| --- |

| **Student Name:** Ethan | P2 |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This House Would Place significant tax on companies that use Artificial Intelligence. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s choice of words was persuasive and strategic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |

| **Teacher comments:**  Good ideas, but needs to be fleshed out more!  We need to be comparative through our speech. While negative analysis of opponents points help, there is more to it than just saying them to be persuasive enough to win over them!  **Opening**   * I like the strong illustration of being fired from job out of the blue for AI increase! * This focus was dropped later in the speech, this needed to continue!   **Rebuttal**   * You pointed out why LLMs cannot self-learn destructively, but this was not explained well; we need more analysis here * Good point that most people would be affected negatively if they lose jobs, but I am unclear why welfare will not work here!   **Arg 1**   * You talked about how majority of people may lose purpose of life * I am unclear why this is true, especially because people can still pursue their own hobbies and so on! * Your impacts on physical health also does not explain how 9-5 work in your world is helping with that!   **Style**   * We need a more confident body language, and we need more hand gestures! * We need to generally increase our eye contact (to all of the audience)! * Lets have better enunciations in speech! * Please try to adopt some facial structure as well! * We also need to speak longer! * We need to minimize random pauses in our speech, and need to sound more clear!   04:26! |
| --- |

| **Student Name:** Amanda | O2 |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This House Would Place significant tax on companies that use Artificial Intelligence. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s choice of words was persuasive and strategic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |

| **Teacher comments:**  Good ideas, but needs to be fleshed out more!  We need to be comparative through our speech. While negative analysis of opponents points help, there is more to it than just saying them to be persuasive enough to win over them!  **Opening**   * The hook gave a weighing, not an engaging start! * We need to start with something that is delivered with conviction, and helps explain your point better!   **Rebuttal**   * I like the nuance of using both the case studies of computers and the internet, as they have if anything helped life much more with incorporating them into life! * Here you could mention measures taken to ensure AI will be kept under regulation properly! For example, the law of robotics means they cannot ever harm a human, and so on. Also talk about kill switches, how humans can stop them simply!   **POI ANS:** Clear and to the point on why inflation is not mutually exclusive, very well put!  **Arg 1**   * I like the nuance of how AI can give many jobs to people as well! * I like the additional bit here that acknowledges that the likely scene is “some” jobs lost, but not as massive, on net! * Do not be like by 2030, X will happen. Frame them as structural events instead. E.g., that it is likely that the near future, would have X, because of Y reasons.   **Style**   * We need a more confident body language, and we need more hand gestures! * We need to generally increase our eye contact (to all of the audience)! * Lets have better enunciations in speech! * Please try to adopt some facial structure as well! * Good clarity in the speech!   04:58! |
| --- |

| **Student Name:** Elvina | P3 |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This House Would Place significant tax on companies that use Artificial Intelligence. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s choice of words was persuasive and strategic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |

| **Teacher comments:**  Good ideas, but needs to be fleshed out more!  We need to be comparative through our speech. While negative analysis of opponents points help, there is more to it than just saying them to be persuasive enough to win over them!  **Opening**   * The hook gave a weighing, not an engaging start! * We need to start with something that is delivered with conviction, and helps explain your point better!   **Rebuttal**   * Good point that you could use the tax for giving people welfare! * On your response to the opp team on where their funding will come from, they had actually well explained it already! They talked about all the regular sources of taxation by the government!   **Clash 1**   * I am unclear on whether our pros are better than your pros, and our cons are better than your cons as a complete analysis. We need to go deeper here and explain with substance! * You could hammer a lot more on the unemployment point! * You could also talk more about the point of AI going rogue in its worst possible case (why the risk is not worth it)!   **Style**   * We need a more confident body language, and we need more hand gestures! * We need to generally increase our eye contact (to all of the audience)! * Lets have better enunciations in speech! * Please try to adopt some facial structure as well! * Good clarity in the speech!   04:27! |
| --- |